

## A Fascinating Compilation of Early U.S. Off-Metal/Wrong Planchet Struck Coins by Saul Teichman

[Editor:] In a recent communication with Saul Teichman who recently retired and has a long time collecting interest in U.S. Patterns and Off-Metal Strikes, came a most interesting compilation of off-metal/wrong planchet errors on Liberty Seated, the Barber designed series, Standing Liberty quarters and Walking Liberty half dollars. All such errors are considered rare or extremely scarce, and are generally sought after by many advanced collectors.

Sometimes E-Gobrecht covers periods before and after the 19th century period of the Liberty Seated designs and this is just such a case. The following is what Saul has been able to put together after many years of research and tracking...

"With regard to Liberty Seated errors, I am aware of the following 2 others than those which were listed in the Mint Error Appendix in Judd (1841 Dime on cent planchet & 1846 Cent on silver half dollar).

**1860-O** mated pair with half dime – pulled from Heritage 1/24 FUN – PCGS63 46797350-1 \*\*\*

\*\*\*Note: This extraordinary specimen and its known story was covered back in the December 2023 issue of E-Gobrecht, so if you missed it, please go back and check it out.

**No date S mint** half struck on quarter planchet (ex Wheeler-GreatCollections.com 9/19 at \$51,755– NGCAU50 5704019-001)

I am not aware of any wrong planchet Barber coinage other than some Barber dimes on foreign planchets.

The following might be of interest to your readers...

**Liberty Head "V" Nickels on Cent Planchets - probably 60 or so known - Years missing 1883 w/cent, 1884, 1885, 1887, 1891, 1909 & 1912:**

1883NC 1) PC Clark (Bolender 11/32 lot 859) as AU, 58 ANA lot 443 as XF ?, Federal Coin Exchange 8/60 lot 2444 as Unc, 64 ANA lot 733 Unc, Cohen-Halpern FPL, B/R 1/85 Unc at \$1210, Lighterman - NGC65BN 1608756-002 – are there two coins here or does part of this pedigree belong to the next ?

2) Paramount 5/70 lot 689 – Unc. same as above ?

3) Circulated - eBay April 2011 by E-adventure II/Paper chase issue would like to see this piece slabbed, might be a fake?

4) ANA Museum - 1989.0135.0017 also corroded, is this genuine ?, looks fake to me and Fred Weinberg

1886 1) NERCA 11/81 VF

(Continued on next page)

(Continued from previous page)

2) Schornstein, appears AU or better (could be an 1896)

1888 1) Numismatics Ltd Spring 1982 FPL Xan Chamberlain, Heritage 1/07 at \$4744, Pilliod - NGC64BN

2) Green 6/29/06 lot 374 circulated

1889 1) Overstruck on an 1873 Indian Head cent, see September 2002 edition of Coin World.

2) Heritage 1/2005 ANACSF12, Weinberg now PCGSF15 21891113, Heritage 8/19 ANA at \$2520, Sullivan offered at \$3,000

3) Greg Bennick - PCGSF12 2761860

4) Heritage 4/12 at \$1,840, Heritage 1/18 FUN at \$2,640, Sullivan 3/21 inventory - NGCAU50 3419487-001 details cleaned, PCGS AU details cleaned 45558860, retoned 48409897

1890 1) Rausch-Heritage 8/04 - ANACSVG8

2) Federal Coin Exchange 8/60 lot 2445 VF

1892 1) Cohen-Halpern FPL, Numismatics Ltd Spring 1983 FPL, Jim's Coins May 2007 - ANACS58BN, StacksBowers 3/15 (not sold), Heritage 4/20 at \$5,040 - NGC63BN 1583700-001

1893 1) Weinberg 3/99, 99 ANA (not sold), StacksBowers 3/15 (not sold), Heritage 8/19 ANA at \$3,120 - PCGSXF40 3397600

2) T.O. Mabbott, Smithsonian (279171.001)

3) eBay May 2012, May 2015, Jon Sullivan, Bob Moon-Heritage 1/23 - PCGSXF45 03538381

**Note:** one of these is ex-PC Clark lot 868 as VF and/or Bolender's 86<sup>th</sup>. Newcomer had one. The 100 Greatest Mint Errors example could be another if it is not #2.

1894 1) Weinberg at 2015 ANA - VF scratched, Sullivan 2/21 inv, Bob Moon-Heritage 1/23 PCGSXF45BN 32814031

1895 1) Superior 9/06 - PCGSVF35

1896 1) 64 ANA lot 734 as VF, Weinberg Spring 1981 FPL, Weinberg 3/02 FPL, Feldman-Heritage 9/24 at \$3,120 - PCGSAU50BN 21040728

2) Heritage 9/05, 1/06 - StacksBowers 3/15 (not sold), Heritage 8/19 ANA at \$3,360, Bob Moon - PCGSAU53BN 21628069

1897 1) Weinberg 12/98 FPL Unc, Weinberg 9/99 FPL, Weinberg 2004 FPLs, Heritage 12/24 at \$2,040 - PCGSAU55 5483273

1898 1) Weinberg 12/98 FPL XF, Weinberg 9/99 FPL, **Saul Teichman** - PCGSAU55

1899 1) Weinberg 11/06, StacksBowers 3/15 (not sold), Heritage 4/20 at \$4,800 - PCGSAU58, 08661885 illustrated on cover of MECCA 4/75

2) CMB 01328-Smithsonian VF

1900 1) Charles "Suitcase" Foster (1950s dealer), unknown intermediates, Sullivan 10/19, 9/20, 5/21 inventory - PCGSVF25 38218063

1901 1) B/R 11/83 lot 2475 XF45, Leidman inventory 9/20/00 - ANACSAU50, eBay 9/00, Heritage 4/3/01 on-line auction, Rich Schemmer 4/02, B/M 9/02 at \$4600 as NGCAU55BN, StacksBowers 3/15 (not sold), Heritage 8/19 ANA at \$3,000, Sullivan offered at \$4,000 - PCGSAU55BN 90075637, scratch below left pellet on reverse

2) NERCA 11/81 VF

3) Col Green?, Bolt UNC probably same as Rausch-Heritage 1/05 at \$8,625, Heritage 6/05 at \$5,463, Libbert-Heritage 9/24 at \$6,000 - PCGS63BN

4) Rausch-Heritage 7/05 at \$3,738, Weinberg 2006 inventory, StacksBowers 3/15 (not sold), Heritage 4/20 at \$3,120 - PCGSAU58BN 21726729

(Continued on next page)

(Continued from previous page)

5) Heritage 8/12 at \$1,998 – NGC Unc details cleaned, Sullivan - PCGS62 35100062, See also Weinberg Summer 79 FPL.

1902 1) Heritage 9/24 – PCGS AU details, damaged 49100280

1903 1) Numismatic Enterprises 2/68 lot 586 Unc, same as NGC Unc details cleaned 3837023-004, PCGS AU details cleaned 37080701, Sullivan offered at \$2,500, Heritage 8/22 at \$2,400

1904 1) Weinberg 12/98 FPL AU, Weinberg 9/99 FPL, B/M 8/2000 ANA, StacksBowers 3/15 (not sold), Heritage 4/20 at \$2,280, Sullivan 3/24 inventory – PCGSXF45 5483288

2) Heritage 8/11 at \$2,530 – PCGSAU55BN

3) Heritage 4/13 at \$3,525, Jon Sullivan – PCGS62BN

1905 1) Weinberg 2004 FPLs, Feldman-Heritage 8/24 ANA at \$3,120, Sullivan – PCGSAU50BN 21670899

2) Woloch-Heritage 7/22 at \$8100 – NGC65RB 2126467-002, One was listed in Elder 6/35 lot 1944 as Unc possibly same as above. Another on Philippine one centavo planchet.

1906 1) Weinberg 3/99, Heritage 2/02 at \$805, Weinberg, 2002 ANA as PCGS F15, Stacks 1/03 unslabbed, Heritage 8/19 ANA at \$1,380, Sullivan offered at \$2,300, Heritage 12/20 at \$1,200– PCGSF15 - 3397601

2) Byers 10/05 FPL, Weinberg 5/06 inventory, Walter-StacksBowers 8/18 ANA at \$3,360, Sullivan– PCGSXF45BN

3) Weinberg 3/02 FPL, Heritage 7/02, Heritage 8/04, StacksBowers 3/15 (not sold), Heritage 9/20 at \$,080 - PCGS63BN full date

4) Numismatics Ltd Spring 1982 FPL ?, Rich Schemmer at 96 ANA, Xan Chamberlain – NGC65RB finest of type !!

5) Rausch-Heritage 8/04 - PCGS63BN partial date

6) Weinberg 11/05 FPL, Superior 8/06, Weinberg 11/06, Heritage 2007 ANA – PCGSAU55

7) Heritage 1/09 at \$3,738, Heritage 1/10 – PCGSAU50

8) Weinberg at 2012 ANA, eBay 7/13 US coins online, Tyrone Kemp – PCGSVF20

9) Kagins 7/78, Heritage 12/12, Jon Sullivan – PCGS XF details cleaned

10) Coast to Coast Coins 10/14 eBay, Sullivan 7/19, Heritage 8/20 at \$2,160 – PCGSVF30 24947284

11) Sullivan 10/2019, Heritage 4/21 at \$3,720 – NGC61BN 4837415-001

12) Die cap, Lighterman as NGC66BN, Bob Moon – PCGS65BN 39487339

One of the UNC pieces is ex Brand journal #40155 at \$10 from H Chapman 8/17/07, all 12 of those listed are different pieces.

1907 1) Schornstein, Weinberg 1984 FPL, eBay in August 27, 2002, Weinberg, Heritage 9/05, Heritage 1/06, StacksBowers 3/15 (not sold), Heritage 4/20 at \$5,280 - PCGSAU58 21628068

2) Weinberg Spring 1981 FPL, Superior 5/03, Early American History Auctions 8/03, 2/04 & 6/04 - ANACS Net VF20 scratched, now in a PCGSAU53 holder also offered in Teletrade 3/18/07, Teletrade 4/2/07, Teletrade 4/18/07, and various times on eBay, Heritage 9/16 has scratches left of face and C of Cents

3) B/M 2003 ANA - ANACS63BN, Newcomer had one.

1908 1) 91 ANA lot 722 Unc, B/M 8/2000 ANA – PCGS64

1910 1) B/M 8/03 ANA Fine 12, Weinberg, Heritage 12/24 at \$1,260 - PCGSF15 40045563 scratched

2) Byers, Heritage 1/06, StacksBowers 3/15 (not sold), Heritage 4/20 at \$4,800 - PCGSAU58 21174323

(Continued on next page)

(Continued from previous page)

1911 1) Federal Coin 9/55 lot 1039 VF, Federal Coin 8/60 lot 2447 XF, Superior 9/98 lot 855 AU/Unc, Jim O'Donnell, Superior 2/01, Weinberg, StacksBowers 3/15 at \$4,700 - PCGSAU55 – there could be 2 coins here.

Examples are also known on smaller cent sized copper-nickel planchets (usually South or Central American 5 centavo planchets) – especially 1904-5. The most interesting of these is the 1891 2.9 grams 86.9% copper and 13.1% nickel as NGC63 piece ex Schemmer, Heritage 1/07 for \$2300, Weinberg, Heritage 1/12 for \$1,955 - PCGS63/NGC64. Apparently struck on the same stock as so-called pattern J-1758 !!

The Smithsonian has an 1890 struck on an unknown foreign planchet ex Chase Manhattan Money Museum – see link below

[5 Cents, United States, 1890 \(error\) | Smithsonian Institution](#)

### **Off Metal Standing Liberty Quarters**

Note: List below includes some questionable pieces.

#### **On Cent planchet**

1917 2 reported by Taxay, type not specified – not seen recently

1928 Heritage 1/04 as raw AU53, Heritage 6/04 as SEGS63, Byers as NGC63BN 3374308-001, Heritage 8/11 – obverse and reverse shows die breaks not known on any silver example and also alignment not 180 degrees

No date (1928) Numismatics Ltd (Weinberg), Schornstein-HIM 7/83 at \$1,525, Lighterman stolen in 2001 and recovered in 2009 - NGC65BN 1886094-001 but has same reverse die break as previous in earlier state. Obverse die crack above date is off the flan on this one.

Cline - 50% off-center on struck cent which appears in 2 of Taxay's books. Fred Weinberg says it is a fake.

#### **On Nickel planchet**

1918-S struck 25% off-center (believed foreign flan) – Brand #88728 !! (Leon 10/14/18 for 50 cents), Fred Schornstein – NGC65

1920 – Bolt, Weinberg (obverse illustrated in MECCA 8/74, top of head off flan)

#### **On Dime planchet**

1920 (2 examples) see 100 Greatest Mint Errors for one of these is Lighterman – NGC64 1608756-004. One is mentioned by Melvin Carmichael in the 1/58 Mint Error Collector Bulletin

1930 reported by Taxay

#### **On Foreign (Peruvian 20 centavo) copper-nickel planchet**

1920 – Newcomer (as a pattern), Farouk (lot 2028 as a pattern), Pratt collection per Federal Coin Exchange 8/60 lot 2460, Stacks 1/06 at \$13,800, Byers, Heritage 8/10 ANA (not sold), Heritage 3/11 at \$16,100 – NGC60FH 1995045-001

### **Off Metal Walking Liberty Half Dollars**

#### **On Steel Cent planchet**

1) Off-center ex Bolt, Milt Cohen-Halpern FPL, Schornstein, Karpeles–Heritage 12/22 at \$19,226 – NGCXF45 6602081-001 corroded

(Continued on next page)

(Continued from previous page)

2) ex Weinberg, Byers, Geyer-Heritage 11/13 at \$44,063, Heritage 8/15 ANA at \$30,550 – PCGS64 5490115, illustrated in both error books

**On Nickel planchet**

1) Bolt, Milt Cohen, Schornstein, Lighterman stolen in 2001 and recovered in 2009 – NGC64 1886094-003

**On Dime planchet**

1) 1945 Chambers, Byers, Geyer-Heritage 11/13 at \$41,125 - NGC64 1770643-001, #26 in 100 Greatest US Error Coins

2) Undated reported by Andy Lustig

**On Quarter planchet – at least 16 different confirmed as below:**

1941 1) Kagin's 1/68 lot 1705, Kagin's 9/72 lot 1418, HIM 11/82 Unc at \$1550, Chambers, Geyer -Heritage 11/13 at \$18,213 – NGC64 1816391-013

2) Geyer-Heritage 11/13 at \$24,675, Heritage 1/22 FUN at \$20,400– NGCAU58 3685977-002 part of mated pair (date not on coin)

1942 1) 87 ANA at \$688, StacksBowers 8/18 ANA at \$16,200, R. Karp, eBay 11/21 Dream Trophy – PCGS62 35312056

2) Schornstein-HIM 7/83, Heritage 1/22 at \$18,000, Tyrone Kemp – NGC64 6323077-014

3) Byers, Heritage 1/07 (not sold), Heritage 8/07 (not sold), Geyer-Heritage 11/13 \$17,625, Lustig, Sullivan, Heritage 1/20 FUN at \$19,200 – PCGS65 21481491, only top of date shows, illustrated in World's Greatest Mint Errors

4) Clark Smith's – Unc with strike through under eagle's breast

5) Heritage 2/12 at \$13,800 – NGCAU58 3471964-001, struck on right side 4:30

6) StacksBowers 8/16 ANA at \$12,338 - NGCAU58 4344959-002, centered one of the first 2 or 3 Unc examples probably accounts for the Bolt Collection and/or Bausher (Parke-Bernet 9/69) examples.

1943 1) Clark Smith's – Unc, partial date

2) Mike Chambers, Geyer-Heritage 11/13 at \$15,275, Jon Sullivan, **Saul Teichman** – NGC64 2087278-011

1944 1) Kosoff-B/M 11/85, B/M 8/01 at \$23,000, Heritage 9/03 at \$20,700, Byers – PCGS65 5750723 now dipped, illustrated in both error books top half of date shows.

2) reported

1947/1917 Lighterman – Unc 60 only the very top of date shows

Undated 1) Weinberg-Heritage 5/22 at \$15,000, Sullivan offered at \$18,000 9/22 (PVC removed) – PCGS64 42461049 illustrated in World's Greatest Mint Errors

2) Lighterman – same as the 1947/17 above ?

One of these is ex Cox-Stacks 4/62 lot 2150

S-mint double struck 50% off-center with indent – Weinberg, Chambers, Byers – PCGS65 22052557

One is also reported with 194 of date showing

**On Foreign planchet**

1943-S on brass Peru ½ sol – ANR/Stacks 11/06 (this was accompanied by 2 double struck walkers !!) to NE Numismatics, Heritage 1/08, Geyer-Heritage 11/13 at \$21,150 – NGC63 #43 in 100 Greatest US Error Coins

1945-S on silver El Salvador 25 centavo – Mike Byers, Geyer-Heritage 11/13 at \$15,275 – NGC63 Taxay mentions copper-nickel as well.

**Regards... Saul**

**(END)**